

**Econ 7772: Empirical Industrial Organization**

(This version 08/22/2022)

Prof. Jordi Jaumandreu

Email: jordij@bu.edu

Lectures: T and F, 9:50-11:30 am

Course overview:

This is a graduate course on modern models and tools of empirical Industrial Organization. It includes demand analysis; production and cost function estimation; models of market competition and market power; entry, exit, mergers and market structure; and dynamic models. Subjects will start with theory, but the main focus is practical. Ideally, students should end by being able to estimate elementary models of each type covered in class. Examples with real data bases will be provided, and students are encouraged to gather and develop their own data. The aim of the course is preparing the PhD students for the development of their own research in the area of industrial organization and the economic policy designed to address the negative effects of imperfect competition.

Details:

This Syllabus makes implicitly a selection of subjects, but a further selection will be needed at the beginning of the course so that the chosen subjects can be covered with some detail.

Subjects will be delivered as lectures, but there will be sessions of discussion and presentations on the topics of each subject.

Stata or similar software will be useful, but students should be ready to work with either Gauss, Matlab, R or Python.

Course requirements and evaluation:

There will be several Problem sets that should be handled in before they are briefly discussed in class. Students must complete the assigned estimation exercises and write a short report commenting on the results (probably 3 exercises). Students will choose a paper of their preference among the topics of each subject, and present it in class using their own slides (probably 3 presentations). Grading will be based on the completion of the problems, the work on the empirical exercises, and the student presentations.

## Outline

A few background topics will be introduced at different moments of the course. Three of these topics are:

- GMM estimation
- Contractions
- Semiparametric regression

### 1. Demand Analysis

Uses of demand.

A summary of classical theory.

Demand, products and characteristics.

The basic discrete choice models: Logit and Nested logit.

Estimation of the basic discrete-choice models.

More consumer heterogeneity. Vertical vs horizontal differentiation.

The random coefficients model. BLP.

Estimation of random coefficients models.

Measuring consumer welfare.

New products.

Topics on demand analysis: Geography, Products, Information and selection, Advertising.

### 2. Production and cost functions

Uses of production functions.

Unobserved efficiency, simultaneity and selection. Measurement.

Traditional approaches to estimation: Fixed effects, IV models.

The Blundell and Bond model.

The structural approach to estimating production functions: Olley and Pakes.

Proxying for the unobservable (LP, ACF, Wooldridge, GNR)

Discussion: "collinearity", parametrics and nonparametrics, scalar unobservable.

Comparing results under different approaches.

Hicks-neutral productivity, endogenous productivity.

Multidimensional productivity: biased technical change.

Topics in production and cost functions: Firm-level prices, Demand heterogeneity, Input heterogeneity, Utilization, Markups and monopsony markdowns.

### 3. Competition and market power

Modelling a market: demand, cost and behavior.

Monopoly pricing.

Static oligopoly: Cournot and Bertrand. Other equilibria.

Identification of price behavior.

Repeated games and Collusion.

### 4. Entry, exit, growth and market structure

Models of entry

Models of growth

Endogenous equilibrium outcomes: sunk costs, location, type.

### 5. Collusion, mergers and antitrust issues.

Collusion and antitrust policy.

Mergers: Unilateral and coordinated effects.

Mergers and antitrust policy.

Vertical mergers.

### 6. Dynamic models

Single agent models.

Example: Rust discrete choice model.

Example: dynamics of R&D choices.

Estimation of discrete choice dynamic models.

Multiple agent dynamics.

Example: entry and exit.

Estimation of a model of entry and exit.

## References

### General articles and background books

#### *Theory:*

Anderson, S., A. de Palma and J. Thisse (1992), Discrete choice theory of product differentiation, MIT Press.

Belleflame, P. and M. Peitz (2010), Industrial Organization: Markets and strategies, Cambridge University Press.

Tirole, J. (1989), The theory of Industrial Organization, MIT Press.

Martin, S. (2002), Advanced Industrial Economics, Blackwell Publishers.

#### *Empirical examples, regulation and policy:*

Carlton, D. and D. Perloff (2005), Modern Industrial Organization, Pearson.

Viscusi, K., J. Harrington and D. Sappington (2018), The Economics of Regulation and Antitrust, 5th ed., MIT Press.

#### *Econometrics:*

Wooldridge, J.M. (2010), Econometric Analysis of cross section and panel data. MIT Press.

#### *Overviews:*

Aguirregabiria, A. (2018), Empirical Industrial Organization: Models, Methods and Applications, Academia.

Akerberg, D., L. Benkard, S. Berry, and A. Pakes (2007), Econometric tools for analyzing market outcomes, in Handbook of Econometrics, vol. 6A, Chapter 63, North-Holland.

Armstrong, M. and R. Porter (2007), Handbook of Industrial Organization, vol. 3, North-Holland.

Ho, K., A. Hortacsu and A. Lizzeri (2021), Handbook of Industrial Organization, vols. 4 and 5, North-Holland.

Schmalensee, R. and Porter, R. (1989), Handbook of Industrial Organization, vols. 1 and 2, North-Holland.

### **Demand analysis**

Akerberg, D. and M. Rysman (2005), "Unobservable product differentiation in discrete choice models. Estimating price elasticities and welfare effects," The Rand Journal of Economics, 36, 771-788.

Berry, S. (1994), "Estimating discrete-choice models of product differentiation," The RAND Journal of Economics, 25, 242-262.

Berry, S and P. Haile (2012), "Identification in differentiated products markets using market level data," Econometrica, 82, 1749-1798.

Berry, S., J. Levinsohn, and A. Pakes (1995), "Automobile prices in market equilibrium", Econometrica, 63, 4, 841-890.

Berry, S., J. Levinsohn, and A. Pakes (2004), "Differentiated products demand systems from a combination of micro and macro data: The new car market," Journal of Political Economy, 112, 68-105.

Berry, S. and A. Pakes (2007), "The pure characteristics demand model," International Economic Review, 1193-1225.

Bresnahan, T. F. (1987), "Competition and collusion in the American automobile industry: The 1955 price war," Journal of Industrial Economics, 35, 4, 457-482.

- Conlon, C. and J. Gortmaker (2020), "Best practices for differentiated products. Demand estimation with pyBLP," *The Rand Journal of Economics*, 1108-1161.
- Deaton, A. and J. Muellbauer (1980), *Economics and consumer behavior*, Cambridge University Press.
- Goldberg, P. (1995), "Product differentiation and oligopoly in international markets: The case of US automobile industry," *Econometrica*, 891-951.
- Goolsbee, A. and A. Petrin (2004), "The consumer gains from direct broadcast satellites and the competition with cable TV," *Econometrica*, 72, 351-381.
- Hausman, J. (1996), "Valuation of new goods under perfect and imperfect competition", en Bresnahan T.F. y R. Gordon, eds., *The Economics of New Goods*, *Studies in Income and Wealth* 58, NBER.
- Hausman, J., G. Leonard and D. Zona (1994), "Competitive analysis with differentiated products," *Annales d'Economie et de Statistique*, 34,159-180.
- Moral, M.J. and J. Jaumandreu (2007), "Automobile demand, model cycle and age effects," with M.Moral, *Spanish Economic Review*, 9, 193-218.
- Nevo, A. (2000), "A practitioner's guide to estimation of random coefficient logit models of demand," *Journal of Economics and management Strategy*, 513-548.
- Nevo, A. (2001), "Measuring market power in the ready-to-eat cereal industry," *Econometrica*, 69, 307-342.
- Nevo, A. (2003), "New products, quality changes and welfare measures computed from estimated demand systems," *Review of Economics and Statistics*, 266-275.
- Petrin, A. (2002), "Quantifying the benefits of new products: the case of the minivan," *Journal of Political Economy*, 110, 705-729.



### **Topics in demand analysis**

- Akerberg, D. (2003), "Advertising, learning, and consumer choice in experience goods market: An empirical examination," *International Economic Review*, 44, 1007-1040.
- Crawford, G., N. Pavanini and F. Schivardi (2018), "Asymmetric information and imperfect competition in lending markets," *American Economic Review*, 1659-1701.
- Crawford, G. and M. Shun, "Uncertainty and learning in pharmaceutical demand," *Econometrica*, 1137-1173.
- Crawford, G and A. Yurukoglu (2012), "The welfare effects of bundling in multi-channel television products," *American Economic Review*, 102, 643-685.
- Fan, Y. (2013), "Ownership consolidation and product characteristics: A study of the US daily newspaper market," *American Economic Review*, 103, 1598-1628.
- Gentzkow, M. (2007), "Valuing new goods in a model with complementarity: Online newspapers," *American Economic Review*, 97, 713-744.
- Goeree, M. (2008), "Limited information and advertising in the US personal computer industry," *Econometrica*, 1017-1074.
- Jacobi, L. and M. Goeree (2016), "Marijuana on main street? Estimating demand in markets with limited access," *American Economic Review*, 2009-2045.
- Pinkse, J., Slade, M. and Brett, C. (2002), "Spatial price competition: a semiparametric approach," *Econometrica*, 70, 1111-1153.
- Reimers, I. and J. Waldfogel (2021), "Digitalization and pre-purchase information: The causal and welfare impacts of reviews and crowd ratings," *American Economic Review*, 1944-1971.
- Trajtenberg, M. "The welfare analysis of product innovations, with an application to computed tomography scanners," *Journal of Political Economy*, 444-479.

## **Production and cost functions**

- Akerberg, D., K. Caves and G. Frazer (2006), "Structural identification of production functions," *Econometrica*, 83, 2411-2451.
- Arellano, M. and S. Bond (1991), "Some tests of specification for panel data: Monte Carlo evidence and an application to employment equations," *Review of Economic Studies*, 277-297.
- Blundell, R. and S. Bond, 2000, "GMM estimation with persistent panel data: an application to production functions," *Econometric Reviews*, 19, 321-340.
- Bond, S., A. Hashemi, G. Kaplan and P.Zoch (2021), "Some unpleasant markup arithmetic: production function elasticities and their estimation from production data," *Journal of Monetary Economics*, 121, 1-14.
- Bond, S. y M.Soderbom (2004), "Adjustment costs and the identification of Cobb Douglas production functions," mimeo, IFS.
- De Loecker (2011), "Product Differentiation, Multiproduct Firms, and Estimating the Impact of Trade Liberalization on Productivity," *Econometrica*, 79, 1407-1451.
- Doraszelski, U. and J. Jaumandreu (2013), "R&D and productivity: estimating endogenous productivity," *Review of Economic Studies*, 80, 1338-1383.
- Doraszelski, U. and J Jaumandreu (2018), "Measuring the bias of technological change," *Journal of Political Economy*, 126, 1027-1084.
- Gandhi, A., S. Navarro and D. Rivers (2020), "On the identification of gross output production functions," *Journal of Political Economy*, 128, 2973-3016.
- Griliches Z. and J. Mairesse, 1998, "Production function: The search for identification". In S. Ström (ed.), *The Ragnar Frisch Centennial Symposium*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 169-203.

Levinsohn, J. y A. Petrin, "Estimating Production functions using inputs to control for unobservables," *Review of Economic Studies*, 70, 317-341.

Mairesse, J. and J. Jaumandreu (2005), "Panel data estimates of the production function and the revenue function. What difference does it make?" *Scandinavian Journal of Economics*, 107, 651-672.

Marschak, J. and W. Andrews (1944), "Random Simultaneous Equations and the Theory of Production," *Econometrica*, 12, 143-205.

Olley S. and A. Pakes (1996), "The dynamics of productivity in the telecommunications equipment industry," *Econometrica*, 64, 1263-1297.

Wooldridge, J.M. (2009), "On estimating firm-level production functions using proxy variables to control for unobservables," *Economic Letters*, 104, 112-114.

### **Topics in production and cost functions**

Chan, M., S. Salgado, F. Warzynski and M. Xu (2022), "Firm productivity and labor quality," mimeo, Queens University.

De Loecker, J. and F. Warzynski (2012), "Markups and firm-level export status," *American Economic Review*, 102, 2437-71.

De Loecker, J. Eeckhout and G. Unger (2020), "The rise of market power and the macroeconomic implications," *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 135, 561-644.

Dobbelaere, S. and J. Mairesse (2013), "Panel data estimates of the production function and product and labor market imperfections," *Journal of Applied Econometrics*, 28, 1-46.

Doraszelski, U. and J. Jaumandreu (2019), "Using Cost Minimization to Estimate Markups," CEPR Discussion Paper 14114.

- Doraszelski, U. and J. Jaumandreu (2021), "Reexamining the De Loecker and Warzynski (2012) Method for Estimating Markups," CEPR Discussion Paper 16027.
- Foster, L., J. Haltiwanger and C. Syverson (2008), "Reallocation, Firm Turnover, and Efficiency: Selection on Productivity or Profitability?," *American Economic Review*, 98, 394-495.
- Jaumandreu, J and H. Yin (2014), "Cost and Demand Advantages: A Firm-level Model for the Chinese Exports and Industrial Growth," CEPR Discussion Paper 11862.
- Klette J. and Z. Griliches, 1996, "The inconsistency of common scale estimators when output prices are unobserved and endogenous," *Journal of Applied Econometrics*, 11, 343-361.
- Yeh, C., C. Macaluso and B. Hershbein (2022), "Monopsony in the US labor market," *American Economic Review*, 112, 2099-2138.

### **Competition and market power**

- Ashenfelter, O. and D. Sullivan (1987), "Non parametric tests of market structure: An application to the cigarette industry," *Journal of Industrial Economics*, 483-98.
- Baker, J. and T. Bresnahan (1988), "Estimating the residual curve facing a single firm," *International Journal of Industrial Organization*, 283-300.
- Bresnahan, T. (1980), "The oligopoly solution is identified," *Economic Letters*, 10, 87-92.
- Bresnahan, T. (1989), "Empirical studies of industries with market power," in *Handbook of IO*, vol. 2 , Chapter 17.
- Ciliberto, F. and E. Tamer (2009), "Market structure and multiple equilibria in airline markets," *Econometrica*, 77, 1791-1828.
- Ciliberto, F. and J. Williams (2014), "Does multi-market contact facilitate tacit collusion? Inference on conduct parameters in the airline industry," *The Rand journal of Economics*, 45, 764-791.

- Corts, K. (1998), "Conduct parameters and the measurement of market power," *Journal of Econometrics*, 227-250.
- Ellison, G. (1994), "Theories of cartel stability and the Joint executive Committee," *The Rand Journal of Economics*, 37-57.
- Gasmi, F., J.J. Laffont and Q. Vuong (1992), "Econometric analysis of collusive behaviour in a soft drink market," *Journal of Economics and Management Strategies*, 1, 277-311.
- Genesove, D. and W. P. Mullin (1998), "Testing static oligopoly models: conduct and cost in the sugar industry, 1890-1914," *The Rand Journal of Economics*, 29, 355-377.
- Ho, K. and Lee, R. (2019), "Equilibrium provider networks: Bargaining and exclusion in health care markets," *American Economic Review*, 109, 473-522.
- Jaumandreu, J. and J. Lorences (2002), "Modelling price competition across many markets. An application to the Spanish loans market," *European Economic Review*, 46, 93-115.
- Miller, N. and M. Weinberg (2017), "Understanding the price effects of the MillerCoors joint venture," *Econometrica*, 85, 1763-1791.
- Panzar, J. and J. Rosse (1987), "Testing for monopoly equilibrium," *Journal of Industrial Economics*, 443-456.
- Pazó, C. and J. Jaumandreu (1999), "An empirical oligopoly model of a regulated market," *International Journal of Industrial Organization*, 17, 25-57.
- Porter, R.H. (1983), "A study of cartel stability: The Joint Executive Committee 1880-1886," *Bell Journal of Economics*, 301-314.
- Slade, M. (2004), "Market power and joint dominance in UK brewing," *Journal of Industrial Economics*, 52, 133-163.
- Verboven, F., (1996), "International price discrimination in the European car market," *The Rand Journal of Economics*, 27, 240-268.

Wolfram, C. (1999), "Measuring duopoly power in the British electricity spot Market,"  
American Economic Review, 89, 805-826.

### **Entry, exit, growth and market structure**

Asplund, M. and V. Nocke (2006), "Firm turnover in imperfectly competitive markets,"  
Review of Economic Studies, 295-327.

Berry, S. (1992), "Estimation of a model of entry in the airline industry," *Econometrica*,  
889-918.

Berry, S. and P. Reiss (2007), "Empirical models of entry and market structure," *Handbook  
of IO* 3, Chapter 29.

Bresnahan, T. and P. Reiss (1990), "Entry in monopoly markets," *Review of Economic  
Studies*, 531-553.

Bresnahan, T. and P. Reiss (1991), "Entry and competition in concentrated markets,"  
*Journal of Political Economy*, 977-1009.

Ho, K. and R. Lee (2017), "Insurer competition and negotiated hospital prices," *Econo-  
metrica*, 85, 379-417.

Hopenhayn, H. (1992), "Entry, exit and firm dynamics in the long run equilibrium," *Econo-  
metrica*, 1127-1150.

Hortacsu, A. and C. Syverson (2007), "Cementing relationships: Vertical integration, fore-  
closure, productivity and prices," *Journal of Political Economy*, 250-301.

Houde, F. , P. Newberry, and K. Seim, (2021), "Economies of Density in E-Commerce: A  
study of Amazon's Fulfillment Center Network," NBER Working Paper 23361.

Jia, P. (2008), "What happens when Wal-mart comes to town: An empirical analysis of  
the discount retail industry," *Econometrica*, 76, 1263-1316.

Seim, K. (2006), "An empirical model of firm entry with endogenous product-type choices,"  
The Rand Journal of Economics, 619-640.

Sutton, J. (1997), "Gibrat's legacy," Journal of Economic Literature, 40-59.

Sutton, j. (2007) "Market structure: Theory and evidence," Handbook of IO 3, Chapter  
36.

Toivaven, O. and M. Waterson (2005), "Market structure and entry: Where's the beef?,"  
The Rand Journal of Economics, 680-699.

### **Collusion, mergers and antitrust issues**

Asker, J. and V. Nocke (2021), "Collusion, mergers, and related antitrust issues," Hand-  
book of IO 5, Chapter 12.

Atalay, E., C. Syverson, and A. Hortacsu (2014), "Vertical integration and input flows,"  
American Economic Review 104, 1120-1148.

Farell, J. and C. Shapiro (1990), "Horizontal mergers: an equilibrium analysis," American  
Economic Review, 107-126.

Igami, M. and Uetake, K. (2019), "Mergers, innovation, and entry-exit dynamics: con-  
solidation of the hard drive industry, 1996-2016," The Review of Economic Studies,  
1-31.

Nevo, A. (2000), "Mergers with differentiated products: the case of the ready-to-eat cereal  
industry," The Rand Journal of Economics, 395-421.

Porter, R. (2020), "Mergers and coordinated effects," International Journal of Industrial  
Economics, 1-14.

Sweeting, A. (2010), "The effects of mergers on product positioning: Evidence from the  
music radio industry," The Rand Journal of Economics, 372-397.

## **Dynamic models**

- Aguirregabiria, V. (2010), "Dynamic discrete choice structural models: A survey," *Journal of Econometrics*, 38-67.
- Aguirregabiria, V., A. Collard-Wexler and S. Ryan (2021), "Dynamic games in empirical industrial organization," *Handbook of IO* 4, Chapter 4.
- Aguirregabiria, V. and P. Mira (2002), "Swapping the nested fixed point algorithm: A class of estimators for discrete Markov decision models," *Econometrica*, 70, 1519-1543.
- Aguirregabiria, V. and P. Mira (2007), "Sequential estimation of dynamic discrete games," *Econometrica*, 1-53.
- Bajari, P., L. Benkard and J. Levin (2007), "Estimating dynamic models of imperfect competition," *Econometrica*, 1331-1370.
- Benkard, L. (2004), "A dynamic analysis of the market for wide-bodied commercial aircraft," *Review of Economic Studies*, 71, 581-611.
- Collard-Wexler, A. (2013), "Demand fluctuations and plant turnover in the ready-mix concrete industry," *Econometrica*, 81, 1003-1037.
- Ericson, R. and A. Pakes (1995), "Markov-perfect industry dynamics: a framework for empirical work," *Review of Economic Studies*, 62, 53-82.
- Gowrisankaran, G. and Rysman, M. (2012), "Dynamics of consumer demand for new durable goods," *Journal of Political Economy*, 120, 1173-1219.
- Hendel, I. and A. Nevo (2006), "Measuring the implications of sales and consumer stockpiling," *Econometrica*, 74, 1637-1673.
- Pakes, A. (1986), "Patents as options: Some estimates of the value of holding European patent stocks," *Econometrica*, 755-784.



- Pakes, A., Ostrovsky, M. and S. Berry (2007), "Simple estimators for the parameters of discrete dynamic games (with entry/exit examples)," *The RAND Journal of Economics*, 373-399.
- Rust, J. (1987), "Optimal replacement of GMC bus engines: An empirical model of Harold Zurcher," *Econometrica*, 55, 999-1033.
- Ryan, S. (2011), "The costs of environmental regulation in a concentrated industry," *Econometrica*, 80, 1019-1062.