

- Gramsci, Antonio. *Il Risorgimento*. Rome: Editori riuniti, 1971.
- Kertzer, David. "Religion and Society, 1798–1892." In *Italy in the Nineteenth Century*, edited by John A. Davis, 191–196. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Lyttelton, Adrian. "The Middle Classes." In *Society and Politics in Italy in the Age of the Risorgimento*, edited by John A. Davis and P. Ginsborg. Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
- Nicassio, Susan Vandiver. *Tosca's Rome: The Play and the Opera in Historical Perspective*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999.

## 9. *Tosca* Act II and the Secret Identity of F#

643

Deborah Burton

One musician recently asked this writer, "Why, if Puccini is a good composer, does he end Act II of *Tosca* in the wrong key? The act seems to finish in E minor with the 'Scarpia' motive, but then ends in F# minor!" It soon became clear that an explanation of—indeed a new perspective on—Puccini's compositional methods would be necessary to answer that question properly. This musician needed to see the forest despite the trees: in other words, it is large-scale motivic structures, not traditional surface harmonies, that control this score's organization. The task of this article, then, is to demonstrate the musical logic of the last page and final cadence of *Tosca* Act II, to show how it is both musically and dramatically coherent, and to reveal why the final F# is nothing short of inevitable. If, along the way, the challenges to Puccini's compositional skill are answered, then so much the better.

At the end of Act II, we hear three main tonalities: at 64/5,<sup>1</sup> a single pitch D—on which *Tosca* was originally to have said, "E avanti a lui tremava tutta Roma" [And before him all Rome trembled]<sup>2</sup>—followed by the opera's opening motive (usually linked to Scarpia, but its musical and dramatic significance is much greater<sup>3</sup>) ending in E minor, and finally the F# minor cadence. These pitches—D, E, F#—have been sounded prominently before: in fact, at the opening of the act, the very first three notes sounded are F#, E, and D, the *inversion* of these

64/3 - original version

Lentamente

pppp

E minor

rall.

f

pppp

F# minor

rall. moltissimo...

end of Act II

Example 9.1. D, E, F#: end of Act II, original version. Adapted from Giacomo Puccini, *Tosca*, transcribed for piano by Carlo Carignani (Milan: Ricordi, 1899).

0/0

f

pppp

F# E D F# E D (G#) F# E D

Example 9.2. F#, E, D: opening of Act II. Adapted from Giacomo Puccini, *Tosca*, piano-vocal score (Milan: Ricordi, 1956).

same pitch classes (see Examples 9.1 and 9.2). Could there be a symmetrical plan at work?

Act II, the pivotal act of the opera, was called a "great duel between Tosca and Scarpia" by the legendary singer Tito Gobbi.<sup>4</sup> This tempestuous and violent act begins rather extraordinarily with a moment of calm (and the F#–E–D open-

ing motive). Scarpia is alone. The same F#–E–D motive and the tranquil mood return exactly halfway through the act, after Cavaradossi has been taken to prison: at that moment, this theme returns with both Scarpia and Tosca onstage. We get the final instance of calm at the end of the act—Scarpia is dead, and only Tosca is left standing. Perhaps this too suggests a symmetrical design: in 1895, Puccini had insisted (against Giacosa's wishes) that the act open with Scarpia's monologue, because "musicalmente il pezzo giova" [it is musically necessary].<sup>5</sup> If the composer had, in fact, wanted musical and dramatic symmetry, such an idea would indeed have been directly derived from important aspects of the original play by Sardou, as discussed in the next section.

Furthermore, we shall see that the three pitch classes F#, E, and D guide the structural path of the entire act, forming a tight, symmetrical plan that reflects not only logical musical thought, but the dramatic form and content as well. However, to examine this idea more deeply, we must first look at the nature of the Sardou play from which the opera was made.

## DRAMATIC CONSIDERATIONS

It has been written elsewhere that Sardou's *La Tosca* is an example of the "well-made play" [*pièce bien faite*] for which the playwright was famous—and infamous.<sup>6</sup> That genre can be defined as follows: "A form of drama characterized by intrigue, the well-made play is designed to reflect the tastes and values of a bourgeois audience. Created by Eugène Scribe and perfected by Victorien Sardou, the 19th-century French well-made play relied on skillfully planted hints to bring its plot to a satisfying denouement that would invariably reassert the status quo. Superficial and mechanistic, the well-made play is successful only as farce or light comedy."<sup>7</sup> Although one might

argue convincingly that *La Tosca* is "superficial and mechanistic," the play certainly neither reflects bourgeois values nor reasserts the status quo. Rather, this drama is a tragedy more in the tradition of French dramatists Marie-Joseph Chénier (1764–1811) and Louis-Sébastien Mercier (1740–1814). Mercier wrote that the "end of tragedy is to move men's hearts, to cause tears of pity or admiration to flow, and by all this to inculcate in men the important truths, to inspire in them a hatred of tyranny and superstition, a horror of crime, a love of virtue and liberty, a respect for laws and morality, the universal religion."<sup>8</sup> *La Tosca*, which portrays a woman caught in a fateful (and fatal) struggle between tyrannical royalists and republican idealists, seems to follow these guidelines. But the Sardou play comes even closer to filling the following dramatic prescription set forth by Mercier, who attempted to stimulate republican virtues and unite all classes in patriotic fervor by means of the historical drama: "True tragedy should return to the practice of *Greek drama*, which appealed to all classes, showed the people their true interests, and aroused an enlightened patriotism and love of country."<sup>9</sup>

Mercier's goal of fostering patriotic sentiment through the vehicle of classic tragedy in historical dress is indeed attempted by Sardou in *La Tosca*. That Sardou was fervently patriotic is a matter of public record: a year after his play *Patrie!* had a triumphant premiere, the empire of Napoleon III collapsed and an unpopular provisional government was set up, during which Sardou "saved" the Tuileries from pillage by an angry Parisian mob, leading the way with a handkerchief tied to a walking stick.<sup>10</sup> The playwright wastes no opportunity in *La Tosca* to induce flag-waving sentiments in his audience (the last line of Act II, for example, is "Vive la France," spoken amid the cheers of a crowd). Furthermore, as noted later in the chapter, the characterization of the heroine, the nature of the forces that cause the chief conflicts, and the

overall structure of the play are all derived from the writings of Aristotle and Horace, in fine French neoclassical tradition.

In his *Poetics*, Aristotle prescribes three dramatic unities (unity of place, time, and action), and *La Tosca* conforms to all of these: the drama takes place solely in Rome and occurs within the length of a single day. As to the final Aristotelian unity, that of action (*mythos*), one could argue that the Angelotti story is a secondary plot line, but in fact it is only the technical means by which the main characters are brought together.

In addition, Aristotle states that the action may be either simple or complex: the complex plot will involve *reversal* (a change of fortune to its opposite), *recognition* (a change from ignorance to knowledge), or both. Last, a tragic figure is one with *hamartia* (a fatal flaw.)<sup>11</sup> *La Tosca* involves both many reversals and a change in its tragic heroine from ignorance to knowledge. This transformation profoundly influences her character: in the course of the drama, Floria Tosca grows from a silly, apolitical woman in love (she admires her lover's subversive, republican moustache too much to have him shave it) to an avenging angel fighting tyranny (not dissimilar to the sword-wielding angel atop the Castel Sant'Angelo, which figures so prominently in the third act stage picture). But, more important, she has a fatal flaw—her jealousy. It is this trait that entangles her in the sociopolitical machinery that pervades the historical period: Tosca's jealous pursuit of Cavaradossi enables Scarpia to track the escaped prisoner Angelotti to her lover's secret villa.

Large political forces are used by Sardou in a manner akin to the Greeks' use of fate, the inevitable end to which each character is drawn. Because of her jealousy, Tosca inevitably loses control of her destiny to these forces and ultimately becomes aware of her flaw. Precisely at the central point of the drama (in the middle of the third of five acts), Tosca comes to

knowledge: "Ah! Dieu, et c'est moi qui ai fait cela!" [Ah! My God, and I did this!] After this moment, she is doomed, and all of her subsequent choices are of no avail. For example, to save Cavaradossi, Tosca thinks she can end her dilemma by choosing to reveal the whereabouts of Angelotti, but her lover is arrested anyway (as is Tosca herself in the play's version). She must also decide whether or not to accept Scarpia's sexual bargain; but again, the outcome will be unaffected by her painful choice.

Tosca's moment of knowledge, which arrives exactly halfway through the play, is an example of the symmetry employed by Sardou in this work (which is more a French neo-classic trait than a true Greek one). This formal plan can again be seen clearly in the parallelism of the first and last scenes: in the first, the servant Gennarino is seen lying immobile. He is sleeping, but the audience does not yet know that. The sacristan enters and asks him, "Tu dors?" [Are you sleeping?] Later, the boy asks, "Pensez-vous, père Eusèbe, que l'on y dorme, en enfer?" [Do you think, Father Eusebius, that they sleep in hell?] Sardou is toying here with the similarities of sleep and death. Of course, in the final scene, this parallels Floria Tosca's fearful confusion about her lover. Is he alive or dead? And the first audiences of *La Tosca* did not know the answer.<sup>12</sup>

The play's Scarpia, unlike his operatic counterpart, is also driven by forces beyond his control: he must find Angelotti or lose his position and perhaps his head. In Act II, Scene iv, this is made clear to him by Queen Maria Carolina:

MARIE-CAROLINE: Prends garde que cette aventure ne te soit fatale. Tu as bien des ennemis.

SCARPIA: Les mêmes que Votre Majesté.

MARIE-CAROLINE: Et ces gens-là font courir de mauvais bruits sur ton compte.

SCARPIA: J'arrête journellement ceux qui calomient la reine.

MARIE-CAROLINE: On constate qu'Angelotti, enfermé depuis un an, n'a réussi à s'échapper que huit jours après ta venue.

SCARPIA: On m'accuserait? . . .

MARIE-CAROLINE: Sa soeur est riche et belle.

SCARPIA: Votre Majesté me croit coupable? . . .

MARIE-CAROLINE: Ta réponse est facile. . . Trouve Angelotti.

[MARIA CAROLINA: Take care that this business is not the death of you. You have many enemies.

SCARPIA: The same ones as Your Majesty.

MARIA CAROLINA: And these people are circulating nasty rumors about you.

SCARPIA: Every day I arrest those who spread rumors about the queen.

MARIA CAROLINA: They point out that Angelotti, locked up for a year, managed to escape only eight days after you came.

SCARPIA: They would accuse me? . . .

MARIA CAROLINA: His sister is rich and beautiful.

SCARPIA: Does Your Majesty think me guilty?

MARIA CAROLINA: The answer is easy. . . Find Angelotti.]<sup>13</sup>

The threat Scarpia faces is reiterated later in the act, when a royalist crowd calls for his death. Sardou's Cavaradossi, because of his lineage, also seems fatefully, inexorably drawn into the conflict: his father was a republican who lived in France, and an ancestor, Luigi Cavaradossi, had had confrontations with tyrannical authorities, escaping the pope's archers by taking refuge in the villa's hidden well.<sup>14</sup>

The playwright further emphasizes the eternal, fate-directed nature of the plot by constantly relating the current events of the play to ancient history and by choosing Rome as a setting. Here is Cavaradossi's description of the Eternal City, which proclaims the city's ancient nature while recalling the play's motif of tyrannical abuse of power—and its subversion: "Dans cette ville, qui a conquis le monde, mais sur qui le monde entier a pris la revanche de sa servitude et que toutes

les nations, à tour de rôle, ont assiégée et mise à sac; dans cette Rome des chrétiens et des barbares, des Nérons et des Borgia, de tous les persécuteurs et de toutes les victimes, il n'est pas, vous le savez, un vieux logis, qui n'ait son abri secret, contre le bourreau du dedans ou l'envahisseur du dehors." [In this city that has conquered the world (but on which the entire world has taken revenge by returning the favor, and which every nation, in turn, has sieged and sacked), in this Rome of the Christians and the barbarians, the Neros and the Borgias, of persecutors and all the victims, there is not an old house, as you know, without a secret shelter to hide from the tyrant within or the invader without.]<sup>15</sup>

But the chief means by which Sardou recalls the classic past is in his structuring of the play on the classic model. The Roman Horace (68–5 B.C.), in his *Ars Poetica*, set forth specific rules for drama, including these two: the marvelous and the offensive should be kept offstage, and the play must contain five acts. Sardou's *La Tosca* is indeed five acts long, and, for the most part, the violence is offstage. The only exception is the murder of Scarpia—the torture of Cavaradossi, and the suicide of Angelotti, are out of the audience's sight, as is Cavaradossi's execution (unlike the opera).

Another classic trait that Sardou co-opts is the strict definition of the scene: a new one must begin whenever any character exits or enters, a practice that leads to some extremely short scenes. The librettists of *Tosca* did not limit scenes in this way, which belies any simple numerical comparison of the two works' component parts.<sup>16</sup>

Because Sardou conceived of his play as a neoclassic tragedy, the death of its heroine was obligatory, an opinion that was not shared by the opera's librettists and which led to some intramural conflict. As discussed by Pier Giuseppe Gillio in chapter 11, this volume, *Tosca* nearly went mad instead of committing suicide at the final curtain. But Sardou insisted on

her death. As Puccini wrote, "Circa al finale [Sardou] mi ha detto cose che non vanno. La vuol morta a tutti i costi quella povera donna! . . . Forse vorrà far morire anche Spoletta? Vedremo." [About the finale [Sardou] told me things that will not work. He wants that poor woman dead at all costs! . . . Perhaps he will want to have Spoletta die also? We shall see.]<sup>17</sup>

One of *Tosca's* librettists, Luigi Illica, wrote, "La forma di un libretto la fa la musica, soltanto la musica e niente altro che la musica!"<sup>18</sup> [The form of a libretto is made by the music, only the music, and nothing other than the music!] Did Puccini attempt to recreate Sardou's neoclassic structure in his operatic score? In the context of *Tosca's* Act II, there are at least two ways in which this is indeed the case: the use of an underlying symmetrical plan and the manner in which that plan controls the musical action in an inexorable, fatelike manner.

## MUSICAL ORGANIZATION

The question to be answered is why end the act in F# minor? Concluding in E minor would surely have facilitated a smoother transition to the E major of the following Act III opening. Could it be that Puccini wanted the complete chromatic here?<sup>19</sup> The notes F#, A, and C# (the pitch classes that comprise an F# minor triad) complete the chromatic aggregate. Although it is an intriguing idea, what seems more likely is that there is a connection between the principal pitch classes of these final moments of Act II—D, E, and F#—and those same notes in its opening, played as a simple unison line by nearly the entire orchestra.

The tonality of F# plays an important role throughout the act: we hear Cavaradossi cry "Vittoria!" in F# major at 42/8 (see Example 9.3) and *Tosca* decides to murder her oppressor in F# minor at 59/0 (Example 9.4). But, on the other hand, E is

an equally important pitch: we hear it, as a low pedal point, both before and after the offstage dance music: this E, when Scarpia closes the window just after the climax of the cantata at 19/0, leads to a complete whole-tone bass progression, of which E again is the goal at 20/0 (Example 9.5). When Tosca finally reveals where Angelotti is hiding ("Nel pozzo nel giardino" [In the garden well]), we hear E again as the final note of a whole-tone progression at 39/0 (Example 9.6). These are only two examples of many in which Puccini connects E to the whole-tone scale (which is used throughout the opera): E is also the final note of the opera's whole-tone opening motive (Example 9.7) and, of course, it is the pitch of the Campanone (the Vatican's largest bell, which tolls in Act III), a note that Puccini went to great lengths to determine.<sup>20</sup> E reappears at the darkest moment of Cavaradossi's tragic aria "E lucevan le stelle" [And the stars shone] (in Act III at 12/12), as the root of the same half-diminished chord as the murder of Scarpia at 60/4 (Examples 9.8 and 9.9). These are not insignificant events.

But we must still consider the importance of D as a tonal center in this act. D major is the key of the "Gavotte" at 3/0 (see Example 9.10), D minor the key of the torture scene at 28/0 (Example 9.11), and, of course, Scarpia dies in D minor at 62/6-8 (Example 9.12).

So all three of these notes (F $\sharp$ , E, and D) function as important musical signposts in the harmonic journey that occurs in this central act. Table 9.1 combines all the important dramatic moments of this act, in order of their occurrence, and lists their main tonalities. One can see a very clear pattern of a repeatedly falling and rising third: F $\sharp$ -E-D-E-F $\sharp$ -E-D-E-F $\sharp$ -E-D-E-F $\sharp$ -E-D-E-F $\sharp$ -E-D-E-F $\sharp$ .<sup>21</sup>

The consistent, large-scale employment of the opening pitch classes of the act is a startling enough observation. Yet, the question still remains: why did Puccini choose *these* partic-

Example 9.3. Cavaradossi's F $\sharp$  major "Vittoria!" Adapted from Giacomo Puccini, *Tosca*, piano-vocal score (Milan: Ricordi, 1956).

Example 9.4. F $\sharp$  minor theme. Adapted from Giacomo Puccini, *Tosca*, piano-vocal score (Milan: Ricordi, 1956).

Example 9.5. Whole-tone progression (Scarpia closes the window). Adapted from Giacomo Puccini, *Tosca*, piano-vocal score (Milan: Ricordi, 1956).

39/0

Whole-tone Progression

Example 9.6. Whole-tone progression (Tosca reveals hiding place). Adapted from Giacomo Puccini, *Tosca*, piano-vocal score (Milan: Ricordi, 1956).

L0/0

Motive 1

*ff* *tutta forza*

E Major

Example 9.7. Whole-tone based opening motive of opera. Adapted from Giacomo Puccini, *Tosca*, piano-vocal score (Milan: Ricordi, 1956).

III/12/1

E half-diminished chord

Example 9.8. E half-diminished chord in "E lucevan le stelle." Adapted from Giacomo Puccini, *Tosca*, piano-vocal score (Milan: Ricordi, 1956).

II/60/4

*ff*

E half-diminished chord

Example 9.9. E half-diminished chord at Scarpia's murder. Adapted from Giacomo Puccini, *Tosca*, piano-vocal score (Milan: Ricordi, 1956).

3/0

Tempo di Gavotta

*p*

D major

Example 9.10. Gavotte in D major. Adapted from Giacomo Puccini, *Tosca*, piano-vocal score (Milan: Ricordi, 1956).

28/0

*p*

D minor

Example 9.11. Torture scene in D minor. Adapted from Giacomo Puccini, *Tosca*, piano-vocal score (Milan: Ricordi, 1956).

Example 9.12. *Scarpia dies in D minor. Adapted from Giacomo Puccini, Tosca, piano-vocal score (Milan: Ricordi, 1956).*

ular three notes? They are members of the whole-tone scale that is suggested by the bass notes of the opening motive, and there are many musical moments in Act II that portray F $\sharp$ , E, and D as part of the whole-tone scale, even at the beginning, where F $\sharp$ , E, and D are heard along with G $\sharp$ . If one posits, however, that Act II makes a journey from F $\sharp$  to F $\flat$ , it is striking that, in the opera's opening motive's whole-tone progression (the "Scarpia motive" or B $\flat$ -A $\flat$ -E) the *missing* note is F $\sharp$ .

Although many other key centers occur in this act, the harmony seems always to return to this same inexorable path. One could almost use Table 9.1 as a plot summary of the act; not much else happens. Most of the main musical events that occur in other keys are the *pezzi staccabili* (detachable pieces) those arias that Puccini and Ricordi intended for separate publication and performance. These are musical numbers whose key might be changed in accordance with a singer's registral preferences or removed altogether. For example, we have Scarpia's aria "Ha più forte sapore," written in the key of A $\flat$  major; his B $\flat$  major "Ed or fra noi parliam da buoni amici"; and "Vissi d'arte," which begins in E $\flat$  minor and ends in E $\flat$  major. (None of these tonalities is randomly chosen: B $\flat$  and A $\flat$  are members of the same whole-tone scale, and E $\flat$  major and E $\flat$  minor are the final keys of Acts I and III; also, the G $\flat$  major of Scarpia's "Gia mi struggea" is an enharmonic reference to F $\sharp$ .) Although several other keys are used in this act,

TABLE 9.1 TOSCA'S ACT II: IMPORTANT DRAMATIC MOMENTS AND THEIR MAIN TONALITIES

Note	Harmony	Rehearsal Number/ Measures After	Dramatic Action
F $\sharp$	Opening pitch of act	0/0	Curtain opens
E	Part of opening gesture, D major with E pedal (at 0/1, initial motive of opera appears transposed on E—D—B $\flat$ then as original B $\flat$ —A $\flat$ —E, prolonging the E)	0/1—2/0	Scarpia's monologue
D	D major	3/0	Gavotte
E	Pedal point	5/4	End of gavotte
F $\sharp$	F $\sharp$ minor	9/5	Beginning of Scene 2; Spoletta enters
[D]	D major, B minor	10/10—11/0	Spoletta relates story of chase
E	F $\sharp$ half-diminished seventh, A minor, whole-tone, pedal	13—22/0	cantata begins; Scarpia closes window
D	[B $\flat$ major], D minor, D major, whole-tone, G minor, D minor	25/0—28/0—32/0—39/0 (108 measures of D prolongation!)	"Ed or fra noi"; torture scene (until scream)
E	Whole-tone, pedal	39/0—41/0	Tosca confesses, "Nel pozzo nel giardino"; Mario returns
F $\sharp$	F $\sharp$ major	42/9	"Vittoria!" (midpoint of act)
E	D major with E pedal, as in beginning	44/10	Mario taken to jail
[D]	D minor	48/10	"Grazia ad un cadavere! Come tu m'odii!"
E	E dominant seventh	50/2	"Aiuto" "Odi? E' il tamburro"
F $\flat$	G $\flat$ major, whole-tone, diminished seventh	54/0—55/0	"Sei troppo bella Tosca" / "mi fa ribrezzo! Vai!"; enter Spoletta interrupting



DEBORAH BURTON

Note	Harmony	Rehearsal Number/ Measures After	Dramatic Action
E	Single pitch class	55/31	Tosca agrees to bargain
D	D dominant seventh	56/3	Drumrolls are heard
E	Whole-tone, D major with E pedal	56/15—58/11	Scarpia gives orders to change execution, attacks Tosca; she demands a safe- conduct pass
F#	F# minor	59/0	Scarpia writes the safe- conduct pass; Tosca sees the knife
E	Half-diminished chord	60/4	Murder of Scarpia
D	D minor (end point of opera's initial motive), sin- gle pitch class	62/0—64/5	Scarpia dies
E	E minor (end point of opera's initial motive)	65/0	Tosca places candles and crucifix on corpse
F#	F# minor	65/8—10	Curtain closes

they function only in transitional or leitmotivic capacities. The underlying path of F#–E–D is well trod. Examples 9.13 and 9.14 demonstrate that the harmonic loci of F#–E–D form a perfectly symmetrical pattern. So perhaps Puccini listened to Sardou after all.

The secret identity of F# mentioned in this chapter's title can now be revealed. F# is the pitch class of the bookends of this act, and it is, in effect, being prolonged throughout. This "missing" member of the opera's whole-tone opening motive (B<sup>b</sup>, A<sup>b</sup>, and E) has another significance as well: if we instead label it G<sup>b</sup>, then its secret identity as the third scale degree of E<sup>b</sup> minor becomes evident. It is this note—a downward inflection of the G<sup>#</sup> of Act I's E<sup>b</sup> major close—that transforms it into the E<sup>b</sup> minor of the finale. In short, F#/G<sup>b</sup> is the pivotal pitch class that creates minor out of major, and tragedy out of

Example 9.13 is a detailed musical score for Act II, showing the piano accompaniment with various harmonic loci and dramatic annotations. The score is divided into measures, with loci labels such as II/0, II/3, II/5/4, II/9/5, II/13, II/15, II/21/8, II/22, II/25/1, II/28, II/32, II/35, II/36, II/39, II/41, II/42/9, II/44/10, II/48/10, II/50/4, II/55, II/55/31, II/56/3, II/57, II/59, II/60/4, II/62-63, and II/65. Annotations include "F# min.", "ped.", "Gavotte", "ped.", "Tosca ent.", "Ed or fra noi" torture, "Sprezzo il dolor", "Orsu", "Tosca parlate", "Piu' forte", "piu' non posso" (scream), "ped.", "ped.", "M'hai tradito", "Vittoria", "Salvatelo", "Gia' mi struggea", "grazia ad un cadavere", "Visi d'arte", "Spoletta ent.", "drumrolls", "Ebbene?", "Ma libero all'istante", "ho mutato d'avviso", "safe-conduct pass", "stabbing", "Scarpia dies", "candles", and "curtain".

Example 9.13. Detailed graph of important dramatic moments of Act II and their main tonalities.

Example 9.14 is a middleground musical score for Act II, showing the piano accompaniment with various harmonic loci and dramatic annotations. The score is divided into measures, with loci labels such as II/0, II/3, II/5/4, II/9/5, II/21, II/28, II/39, II/44/10, II/50/4, II/55/31, II/57, II/60/4, and II/65. Annotations include "F# min.", "Gavotte", "Spoletta ent.", "Tosca ent.", "Torture", "Tosca talks", "Vittoria", "cadavere!", "drumrolls", "Ebbene?", "libero?", "mutato d'avviso", "stabbing", "Scarpia dies", "candles", and "curtain".

Example 9.14. Middleground graph of important dramatic moments of Act II and their main tonalities.

triumph, just as the dramatic events of Act II make inevitable the pivotal, tragic conclusion of this tale.

Then, was Puccini a good composer even though Act II ends in the "wrong" key? If judgment of compositional ability in opera depends on a coherent musical structure closely linked to the dramatic narrative, then the evidence emphatically proves that he was indeed.

## NOTES

1. References to the score are made as follows: rehearsal number/measures after. For example, 1/1 denotes one measure after rehearsal number 1.
2. The piano solo version of the opera, shown in Example 9.1, still shows Tosca's famous line at this earlier point.
3. See Deborah Burton, "An Analysis of Puccini's *Tosca*: A Heuristic Approach to the Unifying Elements of the Opera" (Ph.D. diss., University of Michigan, 1995).
4. Mosco Carner, ed., *Giacomo Puccini: "Tosca,"* Cambridge Opera Handbooks (Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 1985), 83.
5. Letter from Giuseppe Giacosa to Giulio Ricordi, in Eugenio Gara, ed., *Carteggi pucciniani* (Milan: Ricordi, 1958), 136, no. 149.
6. See, for example, William Ashbrook, *The Operas of Puccini* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1985), 79.
7. Grolier's American Academic Encyclopedia, 4th edition, s.v. "well-made play."
8. Marvin Carlson, *Theories of the Theatre: A Historical and Critical Survey, from the Greeks to the Present*, exp. ed. (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1984), 159.
9. Louis-Sébastien Mercier, *Du théâtre ou nouvel essai sur l'art dramatique* (Amsterdam: E. van Harrevelt, 1773), 39-40. Quoted in Carlson, *Theories*, 158.

10. Sardou related the events in his memoirs: "La proposition est acclamée. 'Oui, oui, allez! allez! . . . Nous vous attendrons!' . . . Et, suivis par les regards curieux de tout ce monde, nous entrons dans la grande avenue, nous dirigeant vers la Palais. La chose est si nouvelle et si imprévue que nous faisons les premiers pas en silence, tout à l'émotion de l'aventure. La grande allée s'ouvre devant nous, déserte, en plein soleil. . . Et, tirant mon mouchoir, j'improvise avec ma canne un petit drapeau" (Victorien Sardou, *Les Papiers de Victorien Sardou: Notes et Souvenirs*, ed. Georges Mouly [Paris: Éditions Albin Michel, 1934], 301-302). [The proposition was applauded. 'Yes, yes, go! go! . . . We will wait for you!' . . . And, followed by the curious looks of all, we entered the large avenue, going toward the palace. The thing was so new and so unexpected that we made the first steps in silence, completely caught up in the adventure. The great way opened before us, deserted, in full sunlight. . . And pulling out my handkerchief, I improvised a small flag with my cane.] Sardou also volunteered for the army and kept a journal of the siege of Paris (see *Les Papiers de Victorien Sardou*).
11. Carlson, *Theories of the Theatre*, 19.
12. Other references to sleep/death: In Act V, Scene 1, it is the imprisoned Mario Cavaradossi, awakened in Castel Sant'Angelo's chapel, who makes the connection: "Ne me réveillez-vous d'un si bon sommeil que pour m'en faire connaître un autre plus profond?" [Aren't you waking me from such a good sleep to let me find another, deeper one?] Symmetrical placement is also in evidence here: both questions, in the first and last scenes, are asked in a church setting. The third sleep/death reference is made by Tosca in the last act, regarding the murdered Scarpia: "Devant moi il a donné l'ordre qu'on le laissât reposer. . . Il repose!" [He gave the order right in front of me to leave him alone and let him rest. . . He is resting!]
13. Burton, "An Analysis of Puccini's *Tosca*," 328.
14. In an early libretto version, belonging to the Archivio familiare

della Casa di Giuseppe Giacosa, these two characters were conflated: Cavaradossi's father had hidden in the well.

15. "An Analysis of Puccini's *Tosca*," 342.
16. See the Appendix of this volume for a complete comparison of scenes in the play and the opera.
17. Gara, *Carteggi pucciniani*, 172, no. 200.
18. *Ibid.*, 358, no. 528.
19. All twelve half-steps of the chromatic scale. See also Mandelli, chapter 14, this volume, on this point.
20. Puccini had asked Father Pietro Panichelli to discover the exact pitch of the Vatican's largest bell, the Campanone, along with other bells that would figure in the prelude to Act III. The priest, with the help of Vatican musician Pietro Meluzzi, wrote to him in December 1897 with the result—an E<sup>♯</sup> (see Gara, *Carteggi pucciniani*, 155–156).
21. This pattern of rising and falling thirds is common to many surface motives of *Tosca*. A few examples include Tosca's entrance music and, in Act II, its recurrence in "Vissi d'Arte"; the gallows march (50/10); and the interrogation music (13/0). This last is built on a half-diminished chord (F<sup>♯</sup>–A–C–E); of interest is that its first vertical sonority—F<sup>♯</sup>–E–C—is an exact transposition of the notes B<sup>b</sup>–A<sup>b</sup>–E on which the "Scarpia" motive is based. There are all kinds of motivic connections here; for further discussion, see "An analysis of Puccini's *Tosca*."

## 10. Guide Themes and "Reminiscences" in Puccini's *Tosca*

(642)

Marcello Conati

*To Teresa, who has generously given me advice and  
suggestions in the writing of this essay.*

Puccini's *Tosca* demonstrates a structural compactness of a sort that is not to be found in other late-Romantic works. Even the episodes that at first blush seem marginal or subsidiary—the cantoria, *Te Deum*, gavotte, cantata, Roman dawn, and so forth—actually serve the drama, as always with Puccini. In performance, they flow along in it fluidly and rapidly, so that it proceeds from beginning to end in a single breath. Luigi Ricci, who worked with Puccini, calculated that the total length of the music of *Tosca* is one hour and fifty-two minutes—about the same as a single act of Wagner's *Ring*.<sup>1</sup> This compactness is aided by a strongly cohesive dramatic layout, or framework, stripped of marginal episodes. (See especially the elimination of the second act of Sardou's play, which is reduced to an offstage cantata. This has the enormous advantage of removing the queen of Naples' attempt to blackmail Scarpia, which gives him full freedom of action and also total autonomy as a character.) Scene changes are reduced to a minimum (see, among other things, the combining of the prison and firing-squad tableaux into a single act), and the dramatic framework is almost entirely centered on the Tosca-Cavaradossi-Scarpia triangle.<sup>2</sup> Giacosa's job was to confer "literary dignity" on the poetic text, but it was Illica who was for-