

## CITATIONS

**[selected quotations in boldface entries]**

- *Recondite Harmony: Essays on Puccini's Operas* (monograph)

6d1: **Pollaci, Marco. Review: “Recondite Harmony: the first analytic investigation of the operas of Giacomo Puccini, between tradition and modernity.” *Lyrice: Opera e Dintorni* XIX/6 (2012): 26-27.**

“One of the most important scholars of Italian opera has dealt with a subject that has divided critics for a long time: the operas of the great Tuscan composer. Her book *Recondite harmony : essays on Puccini's operas*, finally responds to a query debated among many opera lovers: is Giacomo Puccini a musician tied to the operatic traditions of the 19th century or do his masterworks show elements of innovations by Wagner or the modern composers of Puccini's time? Deborah Burton supplies the answer to this question in a new analytic light. Her book is a truly analytic investigation that examines Puccini's works with an approach that deals with new and original research on the music of one of the greatest Italian opera composers.

Burton's contributions in musicology and in Puccini studies have always been notable. Pianist, musicologist and professor in several American universities, Burton has published in many journals, including *Studi Musicali*, the *Nuova Rivista Musicale*, *Opera Quarterly*, the *Rivista di Analisi e Teoria Musicale*, and she has collaborated (as author and co-editor), together with other important scholars such as Julian Budden and Giorgio Sanguinetti, on the text *Tosca's prism: three moment of western cultural history*. In December 2010, for the centenar of *La fanciulla del West*, she created a website [www.fanciulla100.org](http://www.fanciulla100.org) and participated in numerous conferences dedicated to the opera composer from Lucca. Puccini and Italian opera have always been part of this scholar's musical and musicological activities, who has now published this very interesting analytic work. Many texts have been written on Giacomo Puccini, on his life and on his works, but too often the analytic aspect of his operas—which are among the most performed in the world—has been put aside. The author observes the harmonic structure of Puccini's musical language and her great competence in the field of music analysis contributes to clarifying many aspects of these masterworks.

*Recondite harmony* explores the numerous unknowns that constituent Puccinian structures, at times complex, contain inside their compositional framework. The book offers notable contributions to many elements, until now unexplored, of the Lucchese composer's operas. And the author examines not only the Wagnerian and Modernist musical influences on Puccini's operas, but also the specific elements of his musical palette, in order to probe the contents of both his extraordinary harmonic vocabulary and his compositional procedures.

Deborah Burton supplies numerous musical examples that help in understanding the fascinating analyses of the Puccini's operatic scores. Deborah Burton's text represents years of research on Italian opera and on the work of Giacomo Puccini, and, since November opera scholars have been able to read one of the latest most original contributions on the operas of the ingenious Tuscan composer. The book demonstrates how an analytic approach can focus on opera, and this study represents a notable contribution to the musicological and operatic worlds.” [please see supporting documents for Italian original.]

- *The Theoretical-Practical Elements of Music* (annotated translation)

6d2. **Cohn, Richard. *Audacious Euphony: Chromatic Harmony and the Triad's Second Nature*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012.**

- p. 5: “But there is another available interpretation: perhaps diatonic distance is not the best metric for the situation at hand. In a treatise published in 1796, Francesco Galeazzi estimated the relationship between C major and d minor triads as ‘very irregular and poor’ (*irregolarissimo e pessimo*), even though each has diatonic status when the other is tonic (Galeazzi 1796, 264).<sup>5</sup> [note 5:] “For an annotated translation of Galeazzi's treatise, see Burton and Harwood (forthcoming).”

- articles/chapters:

6d3. Ross, Alex. *The New Yorker* (29 October 2009)

<http://www.newyorker.com/online/blogs/alexross/2009/10/the-case-of-the-missing-candlesticks.html>  
 [“*Tosca* Act II and the Secret Identity of F-sharp”]

[also see complete printout]

“A sidenote: I suspect that this passage in “*Tosca*” left its mark on Gustav Mahler. He first saw the opera in March 1903, and professed to hate it. “Nowadays every shoemaker’s apprentice is an orchestrator of genius,” he snapped in a letter to Alma. That summer, he began work on his Sixth Symphony, whose premiere took place in Essen in 1906. Here is the famous shock ending of the symphony (with John Barbirolli conducting the New Philharmonia, EMI 65285):

It’s not an open-and-shut case of creative borrowing, but the resemblance is striking.

So why doesn’t the act end in E minor, in a deathly fade-out à la Mahler? Why this sudden, strange, almost arbitrary move to F-sharp minor? Another “*Tosca*” volume, “*Tosca’s Prism*,” edited by Nicassio, Deborah Burton, and the excellently named Agostino Ziino, supplies two possible answers. Burton, in an essay titled “‘*Tosca*’ Act II and the Secret Identity of F-sharp,” suggests that Puccini is in essence rewinding the act to its beginning, to the opening gesture of F-sharp, E, and D. Such hidden symmetry is typical of Puccini’s craftsmanship as a composer.”

6d4. Baragwanath, Nicholas. *The Italian Traditions & Puccini: Compositional Theory & Practice*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2011. [“Michele Puccini’s Counterpoint Treatise”]

- p. 35: “Analyses by Deborah Burton, Michele Girardi, and Helen Greenwald have set out to demonstrate the operation of tonal and motivic structures over long stretches of the operas, complemented by dramatic associative meaning.”

- p. 315, note 10. “For information on the Puccini family library, see Burton (1996, 173–86)”

- p. 319, note 21. “Antonio Puccini’s “Repertorio di musica del Puccini” of 1818 is currently held in the Biblioteca dell’Istituto Musicale Luigi Boccherini, Fondo Puccini O.IV.14. It is discussed in Guidotti (1990, 38) and Burton (1996).

- p. 335, note 66. “66. A full account of Puccini’s manuscript, currently held at the Museo Puccini in Celle (Pescaglia), may be found in Burton (1996). It was bequeathed in 1864

to Carlo Angeloni, Michele’s student, who presumably made use of it when teaching the young Giacomo Puccini. It remained in the Angeloni family until 1979, when

it was acquired by the Associazione Lucchesi nel Mondo. I am very grateful to Deborah Burton for providing me with a photocopy of the manuscript.

6d5. Budden, Julian. *Puccini: His Life and Works*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005. [“*Tristano, Tosca* e Torchi”]

6d6. Davis, Andrew. *Il Trittico, Turandot, and Puccini’s Late Style*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2010. [“Dawn at Dusk” (program notes for *Turandot* at the Forbidden City, Beijing, 1998), “A Journey of Discovery”]

6d7. Fairtile, Linda. *Giacomo Puccini: A Guide to Research* (New York: Garland, 1999). [“A Select Bibliography,” “Michele Puccini’s Counterpoint Treatise,” “The Real Scarpia,” “The Creation of *Tosca*”]

6d8. Girardi, Michele. *Giacomo Puccini: L’arte internazionale di un musicista italiano*. Venice: Marsilio, 1995. English translation with some revisions: *Puccini: his International Art*, trans. Laura Basini, Chicago: Chicago University Press, 2000. [“The Creation of *Tosca*,” “The Real Scarpia”]

6d9. Kleine-Ahlbrandt, William Laird. *Tosca’s prism: three moments of western cultural history*, edited by Deborah Burton, Susan Vandiver Nicassio, Agostino Ziino, 94-113. [“The Real Scarpia”]

6d10. Phillips-Matz, Mary Jane. *Puccini: a biography*. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 2002. [“The Real Scarpia,” “The Creation of *Tosca*”]

6d11. Schickling, Dieter. "Fictional Reality: Literary and Musical Imagery in the *Toscas* of Sardou and Puccini." In *Tosca's prism: three moments of western cultural history*, edited by Deborah Burton, Susan Vandiver Nicassio, Agostino Ziino, 121-134. ["The Real Scarpia" and "Possibili fonti storiche"]

6d12. Opera Stanford: <http://opera.stanford.edu/Puccini/Tosca/backgd.html> ["The Real Scarpia"]

6d13. Guy A Marco, *Opera: a research and information guide*, 2nd ed. (New York: Garland, 2001) ["The Real Scarpia," "*Tristano, Tosca e Torchi*"]

6d14. Ya-Hui Cheng, "The harmonic representation of the feminine in Puccini" (Ph.D. diss, Florida State University, 2008) ["A select bibliography"]

- *Tosca's Prism*

**6d15. Ross, Alex. *The New Yorker*, 29 October 2009.**

<http://www.newyorker.com/online/blogs/alexross/2009/10/the-case-of-the-missing-candlesticks.html>

6d16. Marcia J. Citron, "The Operatics of Detachment: *Tosca* in the James Bond Film *Quantum of Solace*," *19th-Century Music*, 34/3 (Spring 2011): 316-340.

6d17. Yoshida, Shinobu. "Modeling Heroines from Giacomo Puccini's Operas" PhD diss., University of Michigan, 2011.

6d18. Gilbert, J. "First page preview." *Journal of Modern Italian Studies* 10, no. 4 (2005).

- Conferences

*Fanciulla 100*

**6d19. Kellow, Brian. "On the Beat," *Opera News*, 75/6 (December 2010) (also in the print edition)**

<http://www.operanews.com/operanews/templates/content.aspx?id=17734>

"Deborah Burton, an assistant professor of music, composition and theory at Boston University, would like more people to pay attention to *Fanciulla*. 'No season goes by without a *Tosca*, *Bohème* or *Butterfly*. But many people have simply not heard *Fanciulla*,' she says. So she decided to do something about it. Working with VITA PALADINO, director of Boston University's renowned HOWARD GOTLIEB ARCHIVAL RESEARCH CENTER, Burton has planned several promising events to coincide with the centennial of the opera's world premiere at the Met. On December 3, the day of the dress rehearsal of the Met's *Fanciulla* production, there will be a press event at New York's Italian Cultural Institute, with a lineup of speakers including WOLFREDO TOSCANINI, the conductor's grandson, and noted Toscanini scholar HARVEY SACHS. On December 6, Boston University is the site of a special symposium and exhibition that includes photographs and manuscripts belonging to the Gotlieb Archive, which houses the complete collections of DOROTHY KIRSTEN and TITO GOBBI, both artists famously associated with *Fanciulla*.

'I always loved Puccini,' Burton says. 'My University of Michigan dissertation was on *Tosca*, but I wrote about it in relationship to an number of his other operas, one of which was *Fanciulla*. It's fantastic music—so sophisticated and so surprising, compared to what you would have expected after *Butterfly*. Very modernist — he strikes out in a whole new way, and yet you know it's Puccini.'

Burton worked on her dissertation in Italy, and she remembers thinking one day, after being submerged in *Fanciulla* for weeks, 'I can't stand this anymore —I have to take a break from all these singing cowboys. I went to the local supermarket in a shopping mall, and that day was cowboy day at the mall. Every single person in there was Italian, wearing a cowboy outfit. I couldn't get away from it!' At the time, Burton faced a good deal of academic snobbery where Puccini was concerned. 'It's gotten much better since I started, back in the '90's,' she says. She does recall handing legendary *Tosca*-hater JOSEPH KERMAN a copy of her finished dissertation. 'He thanked me,' Burton remembers, 'but when he looked at the title, his smile suddenly vanished as if I had given him a dead fish.'"

**6d20. Metropolitan Opera:**

<http://www.metoperafamily.org/metopera/about/education/educatorguides/content.aspx?id=14570>

“Giacomo Puccini’s *La Fanciulla del West* (“The Girl of the Golden West”), first heard a century ago, is set in the American West during the California Gold Rush. Peopled with ruthless bandits, rough-talking but goodhearted miners, a cynical sheriff, and one remarkable female tavern-keeper, it tells a story of love, money, justice, and forgiveness that is as thrilling as any Western movie, wrapped in an unmistakably Italian score. You could even call it the world’s first ‘spaghetti Western.’

The [www.fanciulla100.org](http://www.fanciulla100.org) website celebrates the 100th anniversary of Puccini’s *La Fanciulla del West* at the Metropolitan Opera.”

**6d21. *New York Times*, 5 December, 2010. (also in the print edition)**

<http://www.nytimes.com/2010/12/05/arts/music/05fanciulla.html?emc=eta1>

[also see complete printout]

“As for the work’s current standing, Deborah Burton, an assistant professor of music at Boston University and an organizer of a centennial symposium there on Monday as well as a splendid Web site on all things “Fanciulla” ([fanciulla100.org](http://fanciulla100.org)), said: ‘It goes against a century’s worth of cinematic myths about the Old West. Instead of a strong, silent cowboy rescuing a helpless heroine, we have an emotionally vulnerable bandit rescued by a gun-toting, poker-playing, independent woman. But that’s actually much truer to history.’”

**6d22. Ross, Alex. “The Rest is Noise” Blog:**

<http://www.instantcore.com/buzz/item.aspx?FeedEntryId=116717>

“Next week, Puccini’s ever-underrated *La fanciulla del West* opens at the Met, with Deborah Voigt in the title role. The Dec. 10 performance falls on the one-hundredth anniversary of the opera’s world premiere. Read all about it at Deborah Burton’s absorbing *Fanciulla 100* site. Included are film and audio snippets of Puccini in New York.”

6d23. *America Oggi*, 5 December 2010). <http://www.americaooggi.info/2010/12/05/21906-lirica-la-fanciulla-del-west-compie-cento-anni-tavola-rotonda-allistituto-di-cultur>

6d24. Consolato Generale d’Italia, New York:

[http://www.consnewyork.esteri.it/Consolato\\_NewYork/Archivio\\_News/News\\_150.htm](http://www.consnewyork.esteri.it/Consolato_NewYork/Archivio_News/News_150.htm)

**6d25. I-Italy: <http://www.i-italy.org/16267/puccini-s-100-year-old-girl>**

[also see complete printout]

“On December 10, 1910, the Metropolitan Opera [4] gave its world premiere, a huge event that involved the greatest operatic names of the day, such as Arturo Toscanini and Enrico Caruso. It marked the first time that an Italian opera was premiered in America and both the attention of the New York public and the price of tickets reached unprecedented levels.

One hundred years later, the Met commemorates this event by reprising the opera, in a Giancarlo Del Monaco [5] production from 1991, starring Marcello Giordani [6], Deborah Voigt [7], and Lucio Gallo [8], and conducted by Nicola Luisotti [9]. For the occasion, the Italian Cultural Institute [10] organized an event coordinated by Prof. Deborah Burton [11] of Boston University [12], which included the grandchildren of Toscanini and Puccini, musicologist Allan Atlas [13], music historian Harvey Sachs, as well as Giordani and Luisotti. Del Monaco himself and baritone Lucio Gallo were also present, but as spectators. [...] Finally, the reins were handed to the panel, led by Prof. Burton, the mind and motor behind these centennial celebrations and their relative website, [www.fanciulla100.org](http://www.fanciulla100.org) [15]. After delighting the audience with a 1910 film of Puccini in America (audio and video from two different sources) and a tour of the website and its multimedia treasures, she handed the floor to music historian and Toscanini biographer Harvey Sachs, who moderated a mini-conversation between Walfredo Toscanini and Simonetta Puccini, the grandchildren of the two operatic titans.”

**6d.26. Corriere del Ticino (Switzerland) Sachs, Harvey. “In festa per i cento anni della *Fanciulla del West*, 29 January 2011.**

“LETTERA DA NEW YORK — HARVEY SACHS IN FESTA PER I CENTO ANNI DELLA «FANCIULLA DEL WEST»

**L**a sera del 10 dicembre 1910

fu significativa per la storia della musica negli Stati Uniti: per la prima volta un’opera lirica di un celebre compositore europeo ebbe la sua prima rappresentazione assoluta al di qua dell’Atlantico. Alla Metropolitan Opera House – quella vecchia, ubicata su Broadway all’altezza della 39. strada e demolita dopo l’inaugurazione nel 1966 del nuovo teatro – *La fanciulla del West* di Giacomo Puccini fu portata a battesimo dai cantanti Enrico Caruso, Emmy Destinn e Pasquale Amato. Sul podio c’era Arturo Toscanini, e David Belasco, autore del dramma *The Girl of the Golden West* sul quale il libretto era basato, aveva curato la messa in scena. Il teatro, addobbato di bandiere italiane e americane, era gremito all’inverosimile, nonostante biglietti che costavano fino a 75 dollari (quasi 1.800 franchi di oggi). Le prove erano durate sei settimane, con ottimi risultati, e il pubblico della prima era entusiasta: le chiamate alla ribalta erano 14 dopo il primo atto, 19 dopo il secondo e innumerevoli alla fine – non solo per gli artisti, il direttore d’orchestra, il regista e lo stesso Puccini, ma anche per il sovrintendente Giulio Gatti-Casazza, il quale promise che nel futuro ci sarebbero state molte più «prime» al Met. Puccini, interpellato da un reporter del «New York Times», disse: «Il mio cuore sta battendo come i contrabbassi nella scena della partita di carte. Sono enormemente contento dell’accoglienza e non avrei potuto avere interpreti migliori». Per il centenario di questo evento ci sono state diverse iniziative, prima fra tutte – com’era praticamente obbligatoria – una serie di recite della *Fanciulla* al Met a partire dal 6 dicembre scorso. Si è ripreso l’allestimento del 1991 di Giancarlo Del Monaco; sul podio c’era il lucchese (come Puccini) Nicola Luisotti, attuale direttore stabile dell’Opera di San Francisco, e nel cast si annoveravano la bravissima Deborah Voigt nei panni dell’eroina Minnie, Marcello Giordani nel ruolo di Dick Johnson, alias Ramerrez il bandito, e Lucio Gallo in quello del cattivo sceriffo Jack Rance. La recita del 10 dicembre, a cent’anni precisi dalla prima, è stata emozionante e alla fine c’è stato un party – presieduto da Peter Gelb, attuale sovrintendente del Met – per il cast e per un centinaio di invitati, tra i quali si notavano l’architetto Walfredo Toscanini, nipote del maestro, con figlie e nipotini; la signora Cheryl Green, parente di David Belasco; varie celebrità del mondo dello spettacolo, compresa l’attrice Angela Lansbury; e alcune signore della New York bene in costumi da «vecchio West» invece dei soliti vestiti da sera. Ma anche nei giorni precedenti c’erano state commemorazioni del centenario. Il 3 dicembre si è tenuto un convegno all’Istituto italiano di cultura di New York con la partecipazione del maestro Luisotti, del tenore Giordani, di due rappresentanti del Met e di alcuni studiosi (compreso il sottoscritto) oltre che di Walfredo Toscanini e della dottoressa Simonetta Puccini, nipote del compositore. E tre giorni dopo si è tenuto un convegno più ampio alla Boston University, con relativa mostra iconografica al Howard Gotlieb Archival Center. Forza motrice dietro tutto ciò è stata la professoressa Deborah Burton della Boston University, studiosa pucciniana ed ex residente ticinese, proprio nella casa di Vacallo dove il maestro aveva lavorato alla *Manon Lescaut*. La Burton ha inoltre creato un sito web ([www.fanciulla100.org](http://www.fanciulla100.org)) ricco di informazioni, interviste e illustrazioni. Vale una visita virtuale da parte di tutti i pucciniani che non hanno potuto assistere ai begli incontri di New York e di Boston.

[English translation: “LETTER from NEW YORK / HARVEY SACHS / CELEBRATING THE CENTENARY OF THE «FANCIULLA DEL WEST»

“The evening of December 10, 1910 was significant for the history of music in the United States: for the first time an opera by a celebrated European composer had its world premiere on the other side of the Atlantic. A the Metropolitan Opera House—the old one, situated on Broadway and 39th Street and destroyed after the inauguration in 1966 of the new theater—*The Girl of the Golden West* by Giacomo Puccini was baptized by singers Enrico Caruso, Emmy Destinn and Pasquale Amato. On the podium was Arturo Toscanini, and David Belasco, author of the play *The Girl of the Golden West* on which the libretto was based, had directed. The theater, decorated with Italian and American flags, was incredibly filled, despite tickets that cost up to 75 dollars (about 1800 of today’s Swiss francs). The rehearsals lasted six weeks with optimum results, and the public at the premiere was enthusiastic. There were 14 curtain calls after the first act, 19 after the second and innumerable ones at the end—not only for the artists, the conductor, the direct and Puccini, but also for the General Manager Giulio Gatti-Casazza, who promised many more ‘premieres’ in the Met’s future. Puccini, questioned by a reporter from the *New York Times*, said, ‘My heart was beating like the contrabasses in the poker game scene. I am enormously happy about the reception and I could not have asked for better.’ For the centenary of this event, there were several initiatives, first among them—as they were practically obligatory—a series of performances of *La fanciulla* at the Met, beginning last December 6th. The production from 1991 by Giancarlo Del Monaco was revived; on the podium was the Lucchese (like Puccini) Nicola Luisotti, current resident conductor of the San Francisco Opera, and in the cast numbered the wonderful Deborah Voigt as the heroine Minnie, Marcello Giordani in the role of Dick Johnson, alias Ramerrez the bandit, and Lucio Gallo in that of the evil sherrif Jack Rance. The performance of December 10th, a hundred years precisely after the premiere, was emotional and afterwards there was a celebration—presided over by Peter Gelb, the current general director of the Met—for the cast and for a hundred or so invited guests, among whom were Walfredo Toscanini, grandson of the conductor, with his daughters and grandchildren, Cheryl

Green, relative of David Belasco; various celebrities of the theater world, including the actress Angela Lansbury, and some New York women dressed for the “old West” rather than evening clothes. But in the days preceding, there were also commemorations of the centenary. On December 3rd, a conference was held at the Italian Cultural Institute of New York with the participation of Maestro Luisotti, tenor Giordani, and two representatives of the Met, and some academics (including the undersigned), apart from Walfredo Toscanini and Simonetta Puccini, granddaughter of the composer. And three days after was held a more ample conference at Boston University, with a related exhibition at the Howard Gotlieb Archival Center. The motivating force behind it all was Professor Deborah Burton of Boston University, Puccini scholar and ex-resident of Ticino, [where she lived] in the house in Vacallo where the maestro worked on *Manon Lescaut*. Burton has also created a website ([www.fanciulla100.org](http://www.fanciulla100.org)), rich with information, interviews and illustrations. It is worth a virtual visit there for all Puccini-lovers who could not attend the beautiful encounters in New York and Boston.”]

### Tosca 2000

**6d27. Weaver, William. “In *Tosca*, a Touch of Family History.” *The New York Times*, July 16, 2000.**  
<http://select.nytimes.com/gst/abstract.html?res=F60A11FA3B5C0C758DDDAE0894D8404482&scp=1&sq=In%20%27Tosca,%27%20a%20Touch%20of%20Family%20History&st=cse>

[also see complete printout]

“As the culminating event of a recent conference of Puccini scholars in Rome, the Puccini Te Deum was scheduled to be performed again in Sant'Andrea Della Valle, to celebrate the centenary of “*Tosca*” (first performed at the Rome Opera in January 1900) and, with it, the bicentenary of Marengo. But the Roman Curia decreed that such an operatic performance in the church would be inappropriate. (Admittedly, the Scarpia-*Tosca* scene is pretty steamy.) Fortunately, the program included another Te Deum, properly written for a church; so this second work was indeed performed and applauded with theatrical enthusiasm. [...] For years, the manuscript of the work, along with sheaves of other family music, was preserved in Giacomo Puccini's villa at Torre del Lago, on the Tuscan coast. In 1969, this trove was investigated by the American musician and scholar Herbert Handt; the Te Deum was listed among Domenico's works in the New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians entry by Gabriella Biagi Ravenni, and more recently, another American scholar, Deborah Burton, investigating “*Tosca*,” made the connection between Domenico's piece and the historic event that inspired Giacomo's great scene. So for the Puccini conference, which Ms. Burton helped organize, it seemed right to give the grandfather's score its first modern hearing.”

6d28. Phillips-Matz, Mary Jane. *Puccini: a biography*. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 2002.

### • dissertation

**6d29. Baragwanath, Nicholas. “Analytical Approaches to Melody in Selected Arias by Puccini.” *Music Theory Online*, 14/2 (June 2008).**

<http://www.mtosmt.org/issues/mto.08.14.2/mto.08.14.2.baragwanath.html>

- “[6] Burton’s analysis (1995) of melody comprised one aspect of a broader search for musico-dramatic coherence in *Tosca*. It was underpinned by a more structuralist concept of the *Grundmotiv* derived from Schoenberg, premised upon ideas of organicism and unity, and concluded that the “motivic material is interrelated and derived from a small number of primary motivic cells,” identified as (“x”) the stepwise perfect fourth, (“y”) the stepwise major or minor third, and (“z”) the perfect fourth plus major or minor second.(8) Her analyses of the main melodies of the opera point out occurrences and transformations of these basic cells, aligned to considerations of dramatic context.”

- “[7] Girardi’s analyses (1995) likewise tend to assume a fundamentally motivic basis to Puccinian melody in order to draw attention to numerous similarity relationships, both within individual melodies and throughout entire operas. With regard to melodic construction his theory is based, like Burton’s, upon the notion of generative intervals that provide underlying musical coherence. Elphinstone (1996) continued in this vein by postulating a structural hierarchy of four types of theme operating within the melodic material of Puccini’s *Manon Lescaut*: “temi conduttori” (leading themes), “temi occasionali” (occasional themes), “cellule-mosaico” (mosaic cells), and “tessuto connettivo” (connective tissue).”

- Note 1. Among the best such studies are: Deborah Burton's discussion of "Illustrative musical tools" in "An Analysis of Puccini's *Tosca*: A Heuristic Approach to the Unifying Elements of the Opera" (PhD diss., University of Michigan, 1995); and Helen M. Greenwald, "Character Distinction and Rhythmic Differentiation in Puccini's Operas," in Gabriella Biagi Ravenni and Carolyn Gianturco, *Giacomo Puccini: L'uomo, il musicista, il panorama europeo* (Lucca: LIM, 1997), 495–515.

- Note 8. "Burton, 'An Analysis,' 148, 290. Burton's heuristic approach relies upon an artificial distinction between 'IM' (Illustrative Musical) and 'OM' (Organisational Musical) tools. This offers much in terms of methodological clarity, but only at the expense of placing drastic constraints upon what can be investigated as structurally significant. Her category of 'organisational' tools follows a number of previous studies by concentrating primarily upon issues of motivic construction."

- Note 21. "Previous applications of Schenker's theories to Italian opera and Puccini have concentrated primarily on tonal and motivic structures rather than, as here, melodic patterns. See: [...] Deborah Burton, 'An Analysis,' and Deborah Burton, 'Tristano, *Tosca* (e Torchi),' in *Giacomo Puccini: L'uomo*, ed. Biagi Ravenni and Gianturco, 127–146."

6d30. Budden, Julian. *Puccini: His Life and Works*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.

6d31. Chattah, Juan. "Tosca's Prism: Three Moments in Western Cultural History," *Gamut: Online Journal of the Music Theory Society of the Mid-Atlantic*: 3/1, Article 9. (2010): <http://trace.tennessee.edu/gamut/vol3/iss1/9>.

6d32. Conati, Marcello. "Guide-Themes and Reminiscences in *Tosca*." In *Tosca's prism: three moments of western cultural history*, edited by Deborah Burton, Susan Vandiver Nicassio, Agostino Ziino, 167-182.

6d33. Davis, Andrew. *Il Trittico, Turandot, and Puccini's Late Style*. (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2010).

6d34. Fairtile, Linda. *Giacomo Puccini: A Guide to Research* (New York: Garland, 1999).

6d35. Greenwald, Helen M. "Giacomo Puccini: A Guide to Research." *Notes*, 1999. [review]

6d36. Gillio, Pier Giuseppe. "New Sources for the History of the Libretto," *Tosca's prism: three moments of western cultural history*, Eds. Deborah Burton, Susan Vandiver Nicassio, Agostino Ziino, 183-220.

6d37. Girardi, Michele. *Giacomo Puccini: L'arte internazionale di un musicista italiano*. Venice: Marsilio, 1995. English translation with some revisions: *Puccini: his International Art*, trans. Laura Basini, Chicago: Chicago University Press, 2000.

**6d38. Greenwald, Helen M. "Recent Puccini Research." *Acta Musicologica* 65/1 (Jan. - Jun., 1993), 23-50.**

Note 7: "Burton's work (in progress) seeks to clarify unifying features of *Tosca*, if, however, somewhat differently than Atlas, who views the organization of the opera to be grounded in two opposing tritones."

**6d39. Greenwald, Helen M. "Puccini, *Il tabarro*, and the Dilemma of Operatic Transposition." *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 51/3 (Autumn, 1998), 521-558.**

- p. 522, note 2: "Deborah Burton, in her analysis of *Tosca*, posits 'a simpler taxonomy that will, perhaps, resolve these apparently conflicting analytical constructs' ("An Analysis of Puccini's *Tosca*: A Heuristic Approach to the Unifying Elements of the Opera" [Ph.D. diss., The University of Michigan, 1995], 3).

- p. 528, note 23. Bernard Shaw, *Music in London, 1890-94*, 3 vols. (1932; reprint, London: Constable, 1950), 3:219. Burton discusses Wagner's thematic influence on *Tosca* in "Analysis of Puccini's *Tosca*," and sp. chap. 3, pp. 146-80, and the section entitled "Homages to Wagner," 2 39-43, in which she identifies further 'oltralpica' borrowings."

- p. 557, note 68. "The letter is housed in the copialettere in the Ricordi archive in Milan. I wish to thank Deborah Burton for pointing it out to me."

6d40. Nicassio, Susan V. *Tosca's Rome* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999).



6d41. Phillips-Matz, Mary Jane. *Puccini: a biography*. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 2002.

6d42. Guy A Marco, *Opera: a research and information guide*, 2nd ed. (New York: Garland, 2001).

**6d43. Wilson, Alexandra. "Tosca's Rome: The Play and the Opera in Historical Perspective by Susan Vandiver Nicassio." *Music & Letters* Vol. 82, No. 1 (Feb., 2001), 131-133. [review].**

"What [Nicassio] terms her 'analysis' consists of simply presenting the musical themes associated with the principal characters, and even here she has drawn her readings from the well-worn writings of Mosco Carner, Charles Osborne and the like (with more recent insights by Deborah Burton and Roger Parker)."

6d44. Ya-Hui Cheng, "The harmonic representation of the feminine in Puccini" (Ph.D. diss, Florida State University, 2008): 13-15.

### **(3). Deborah Burton**

Deborah Burton aligns fundamentally with Atlas and Greenwald. Her 1995 dissertation, entitled "An Analysis of Puccini's *Tosca*: A Heuristic Approach to the Unifying Elements of the Opera," represents the first purely theoretical approach to Puccini by an American music theorist. This dissertation sets out to outline a methodology for the analysis of opera, and Burton uses *Tosca* as a heuristic example in order to serve and support the innovative music-analytical procedure.<sup>24</sup> Among the many new analytical tools that she produces, the primary one is called the "M-tool" (musical tool), which serves as the entry level to divide composers' musical materials into different categories. After the musical materials are categorized, they go on to the OM and IM sections for second-level analysis. The OM stands for the *grammatical organizational* musical tool. It is used to analyze the structure of operas. The IM means the *illustrative* musical tool and is used to express the operatic dramatic vocabulary. The use of OM and IM separates the musical illustration from structural organization. In so doing, Burton provides a deep analysis of tonal coherence that goes beyond what has been provided by previous scholars.

In addition to the new analytic procedure, Burton also introduces atonal theory into her analysis of Puccini. Instead of utilizing the conventional group of tonal dissonant functions such as decoration, prolongation, and association,<sup>25</sup> she views dissonant notes themselves as possibilities for prolongation. In addition, she groups the dissonant sonorities into motivic cells, which is made through the intervallic relationship, and analyzes each dissonant cell over a large span of music. She also uses the concept of atonal transposition to replace the notion of tonal harmonic progression, such that she describes the motion from dominant to tonic as the motion from T5 to T1. Both the reinforcement of functional dissonance and the focus on the transposition operation are significant contributions in that they break the entrenched boundaries within the respective areas of tonal and atonal theory and link them together. In other words, she provides a way to manage the smooth transition between the two domains.



On the one hand, as her treatment of dissonance departs from the underlying tonal structure, traditional notions of tonal hierarchy and prolongation are greatly weakened. Her use of the transposition operator for tonal progression suggests an equivalence between tonic and dominant, and focuses more on pitch centricity, rather than traditional tonal prolongation. Burton does indeed state that the subject of prolongation can be either a tonal triad or a pitch class preserved from point A - to - point A and:

that [the point A to point A] journey is not a direct one; inserted into the route are many detours, some serving illustrative purposes, and some providing side trips through secondary areas. Nevertheless, the ultimate tonal destination always remains in sight.<sup>26</sup>

However, she never attempts to differentiate triadic and pitch-class prolongations in her analysis. As a result, even if her analysis suggests a tonal/pitch-class structural coherence in opera repertoire, the basis of that structural coherence remains ambiguous.

This ambiguity presents a number of questions. Are Puccini's operas written in a tonal system or an atonal one, or something in between? Given the clear underlying pitch centricity in Puccini's works, the answer should most likely be either tonal or something in between. If the piece is written using a tonally-derived system, her analysis loses something critical in its dismissal of tonal hierarchic function. If the piece is written with a facile vacillation between tonal and atonal systems, her mixed approach gains validity.<sup>27</sup> However, the greater the extent to which one mixes up the two systems, the greater the ambiguity of the line between the tonal and atonal. If Puccini mixes tonal and atonal languages in his operas, does there have to be a distinct boundary between tonal and atonal systems? And, if such a thing can be does exist, what is it and how do we define it? Burton does not take up this question of boundaries, nor does she attempt to address the conflict between the two different systems.<sup>28</sup> In not doing so, however, she actually highlights the very polemical question that she ignores: What is the main theoretical system at work in *Tosca*?

On the other hand, although Burton analyzes tonal coherence at a deeper middle-ground level, she neglects the foreground, stating that it is essentially non-functional. Thus, she favors larger-scale structural analysis over any notion of musical surface.<sup>29</sup> As her work focuses on presenting the deeper structure of *Tosca*, ultimately, she has much to offer. Yet, her neglect of local musical motion and larger-scale dramatic/structural plans, is a gap that will be filled in the present dissertation. My study focuses on Puccini's local harmony to enhance and engage drama as well as incorporating various musical styles (both exotic and avant-garde) into his fundamentally tonal language.